The following is a comparative analysis of the AZA standards of care for elephants to the facilities at the PAWS sanctuary:

|               | Woodland Park Zoo   | PAWS Sanctuary  |
|---------------|---|---|
| Indoor space  | Approximately 2,400 square foot barn for 3 elephants' prolonged lock up.  | PAWS currently has 3 elephant barns all of which far exceed zoo industry standards for elephants as follows: <b>12,000 ft²</b> (1,114 m²) for African females; <b>9,000 ft²</b> (836 m²) for Asian females; and 3 bull barns 5,000 ft² (464 m²), 8,000 ft² (743 m²) and 9,000 ft² (836 m²). |
| Outdoor space | Less than 1 acre. Although the yard is 1 acre, it is divided into 5 pens. Bamboo and Watoto must always be kept separated, therefore the elephants never have 1 acre of space.        | Over <b>80 acres</b> (3,500,000 ft <sup>2</sup> / 325,160 m <sup>2</sup> ) for female African elephants and <b>40</b> + <b>acres</b> (1,742,397 ft <sup>2</sup> / 161,874 m <sup>2</sup> ) for Asian elephants. PAWS has space for future expansion if necessary.                           |
| Climate       | Seattle's climate is too cold and wet forcing the elephants to be locked in a tiny, barren barn stall 16-17 hours a day for about 7 months of the year regardless of the temperature. | PAWS is located in a warm climate. Only on very rare occasions does the temperature drop below 40° F. The barns are temperature controlled and, when they are not being cleaned, are always available to the elephants day and night.   |
|               | The elephants are not monitored by staff 24 hours a day.  | PAWS has staffing shifts set up to ensure that elephants are monitored 24 hours a day regardless of the temperature.  |

| Substrate indoors     |   | Heated, rubberized flooring in the African telephant barn. Sandy loam flooring in Asian elephant barn. Each barn has a supplementary cement substrate area used for bathing, medical procedures, foot care, etc.  |
|-----------------------|---|---|
| Substrate<br>outdoors | Outdoor yard surfaces are hard, compacted dirt. In some places there are concrete slabs. No covered, dry area for feeding.  | Outdoor enclosures feature a variety of natural substrate types, including pasture, and varied terrain including hills, meadows, ponds, lakes and living trees. The large size of the enclosures facilitates the growth of natural vegetation without being constantly trampled and provides adequate drainage.   |
| Enrichment            | Food and browse are the main enrichment put in the same places. Boomer balls, tied down old logs and tire. Enrichment is much the same for the past 6 years of observations.  All living trees are kept from elephants by electrified wire.  Elevation gain is estimated at 10 – 15 feet.  No therapeutic pool. | Inherently complex natural terrain, includes stumps, trees, rocks, viewing points, sand pits, mud wallows, ponds and lakes. The African elephants spend their time socializing and grazing as well as browsing over the diverse terrain which includes lakes and ponds, mud holes and steep hills. There is a 200' difference in elevation within the African habitat which promotes climbing.  Sand is provided in the barns to allow dust bathing indoors.  The African barn also has an 8 ft (2.44 m) deep therapeutic pool. |

| Social requirements | elephants should not be housed together, yet WPZ continues to do so. Bamboo and Watoto are incompatible, and must always be kept separated. In the barn, one of  | PAWS currently has 3 female African elephants, 3 female Asian elephants and 2 male Asian elephants (an additional bull is scheduled to arrive very soon). While males are currently housed separately, visual, auditory and olfactory contact with other elephants is maintained.   |
|---------------------|--|---|
| Food & Water        | food with small amounts of other foods. Supplements and vitamins are provided.  It has been observed that water is not readily available in each of the 5 pens. The elephants are sometimes dependent on | Diet formulations, developed on advice of veterinarians and animal nutritionists, include: natural browse including grass, brush, and trees supplemented with Mazuri Elephant pellets, bran, oats, Omolene, Red Cell, Vitamin E and Lubricon. They are also given hay and fresh fruit and vegetables.  There is fresh running water inside the barns and in the outdoor habitats. |
| Cleaning            | daily.   | Barns and small yards adjacent to the barns are cleaned daily and outer areas of the habitat are cleaned monthly, or more often if deemed necessary.  |

| Staff training and attendance | WPZ has qualified keepers who are trained and capable of the care of elephants and their training.  WPZ does not have round-the-clock staffing. | PAWS has highly trained elephant caretakers and consultants on 24 hour shifts and sanctuary directors, Pat Derby and Ed Stewart live on the property and therefore are on call 24 hours per day.  Protocols are strictly enforced to ensure at least 2 trained staff are present when working with elephants.  The PAWS elephant caretaking staff have globally recognized expertise and are consulted by zoological facilities around the world to assist in training staff in elephant care and management. |
|-------------------------------|---|---|
| Vet Care                      | WPZ has vets on staff.  | PAWS accepts elderly and ailing animals, so, in addition to their own veterinarians, they utilize the services of the world's leading elephant veterinarians, many of whom are also provide services to numerous AZA zoos. Vet care is available 24 hours per day as needed.  |

## Time locked in

The elephants rarely have autonomy over when they may enter or exit the barn.
Starting in the beginning of October they are brought in daily at 3:30pm and let out the next morning. This lock up lasts until the end of April or early May of the next year.

Bruce Upchurch, Curator, said at the Dec. 2008 Zoo Board meeting that the elephants get out 7 – 8 hours a day, confirming they are locked up for 16- - 17 hours a day.

Either Bamboo or Watoto is locked in solitary confinement for 16 – 17 hours a day.

This lock up lasts about 7 months whether the temps fall below 40° F or not.

The climate at PAWS is more appropriate for warm climate species, therefore the elephants are outside 365 days/year and can make choices about how and where they spend their time, as well as which elephants to socialize with. The barns are left open (except during daily cleaning and sanitizing) and the elephants have a choice of indoor or outdoor accommodation.

Elephants are encouraged to come indoors at night but have the autonomy to make their own choice and are monitored regularly regardless.

Elephants are only kept indoors when temperatures drop below 4.4° C (40° F), typically a small number of nights each year.

|            | 1                                     |  |
|------------|---------------------------------------|--|
| Disease &  | Hansa died from the herpes virus      | As a rescue facility PAWS has taken in   |
| isolation  | and all three elephants have been     | elephants from both zoos and circuses that                                     |
| facilities | exposed.                              | have come in with diseases. For this   |
|            | Th                                    | reason they have specialized quarantine  |
|            | There are no quarantine facilities.   | areas to ensure there is no spread of disease from new animals arriving at the |
|            | Infection control is not practiced at | facility and to ensure animals arriving are                                    |
|            | WPZ.                                  | not subject to the spread of disease.  |
|            | W12.                                  | Quarantine protocols are set up for each                                       |
|            |                                       | elephant individually by the veterinarians                                     |
|            |                                       | and are rigidly enforced.  |
|            |                                       |  |
|            |                                       | As noted above USDA and AZA zoos   |
|            |                                       | both send elephants to PAWS, without   |
|            |                                       | concern of spread of disease.  |
|            |                                       |  |
| Elephant   | WPZ does not use bullhooks for        | PAWS does not allow the use of bullhooks                                       |
| management | controlling/managing elephants.       | or threats of any kind towards their   |
| management | However, WPZ will chain the           | elephants and after their arrival at PAWS                                      |
|            | elephants' legs or put them in the    | elephants are never chained.   |
|            | elephant restraining device for       |  |
|            | medical procedures.                   | Protected contact is the only form of  |
|            |                                       | training used in order to treat animals for                                    |
|            |                                       | medical procedures, foot care, etc.  |
|            |                                       |  |
|            |                                       |  |
|            |                                       |  |
|            |                                       |  |
|            |                                       |  |
|            |                                       |  |
|            |                                       |  |
|            |                                       |  |
| <u> </u>   |                                       |  |

| Barriers | low fencing that would allow unauthorized people to enter the elephant yard.  There are sufficient barriers to contain elephants within the yard. | PAWS has barriers appropriate to safely contain elephants (California has additional laws to ensure safety, whereas Ontario and some other places in North America do not). The barriers at PAWS are checked regularly to ensure good maintenance and security.  PAWS is a rescue facility that is not open |
|----------|---|---|
|          |   | to the public, so there is no need for secondary barriers to keep visitors away from primary enclosure barriers however they do maintain an 8' perimeter fence with locked gates which keeps the public off the sanctuary grounds.  |